

The Renewal of Employment Contracts Between Professional Football Players and Professional Clubs in Indonesia Based on Pancasila Justice

Dewi Lusiana^A, Agus Mulya Karsona^B, Etty Mulyati^C

Abstract

The transformation of professional football into a global commercial industry has fundamentally reshaped the contractual relationship between professional football players and clubs, extending it beyond a conventional sports agreement into a complex legal relationship involving reciprocal rights and obligations. Despite this development, employment contracts in Indonesian professional football continue to face legal uncertainty, inadequate protection, and recurring contractual disputes, indicating the need for a more comprehensive legal framework. This study aims to examine the legal foundations governing employment contracts between professional football players and professional clubs in Indonesia and to formulate a renewal framework based on the principles of Pancasila justice. Employing a normative legal literature review, this study systematically analyzes statutory regulations, legal doctrines, scholarly publications, and relevant legal literature concerning contract law, labor law, sports law, and Pancasila legal philosophy. The analysis demonstrates that contractual relationships between professional football players and clubs substantially fulfill the essential elements of an employment relationship, namely work, remuneration, and employer authority, thereby justifying the application of labor law protections alongside contractual principles. Nevertheless, the existing contractual framework remains insufficient to ensure balanced legal protection, resulting in persistent disputes and legal uncertainty in professional football governance. The study further argues that renewing employment contracts should extend beyond contractual modifications by incorporating the principles of legal certainty, proportionality, fairness, and balanced protection embodied in Pancasila justice. Accordingly, strengthening contractual regulation, improving contractual governance, and reinforcing legal protection mechanisms are essential for establishing equitable employment relationships and promoting a more sustainable and legally accountable professional football industry in Indonesia.

Keywords: Professional Football Employment Contracts, Employment Relationship, Pancasila Justice, Contract Renewal.

^ADoctoral Program, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia, Email: dewilusiana7580@gmail.com

^BDoctoral Program, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia, Email: agus.mulya@unpad.ac.id

^CDoctoral Program, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia, Email: etty.mulyati@unpad.ac.id

INTRODUCTION

Football is the world's most popular sport and has evolved into a global phenomenon that extends far beyond recreation and entertainment (Giulianotti & Robertson, 2004). The rapid globalization of football has significantly increased its economic, commercial, and institutional importance across both developed and emerging economies, transforming professional football into a strategic industry with substantial social and financial value (Giulianotti & Robertson, 2004). Today, professional football generates considerable revenue through broadcasting rights, sponsorship agreements, player transfer fees, merchandising, ticket sales, and digital media commercialization, making it one of the most profitable sectors within the global sports industry (Dietl & Weingaertner, 2014). This economic transformation has fundamentally changed the organizational structure of football clubs, which increasingly operate as professional business entities rather than merely sporting organizations (Dietl & Weingaertner, 2014). As a consequence, professional football governance has become increasingly dependent on corporate management, regulatory compliance, contractual accountability, and effective legal governance to ensure organizational sustainability and competitive integrity (Franck, 2010). Alongside commercial expansion, legal regulation has become an indispensable component of modern football because virtually every sporting activity is supported by contractual and institutional legal arrangements involving multiple stakeholders (Gardiner et al., 2012). Professional football clubs consequently establish legal relationships with players, coaches, sponsors, investors, governing bodies, and commercial partners, each possessing distinct rights and obligations under applicable legal frameworks (Gardiner et al., 2012). Within this increasingly regulated environment, employment contracts constitute one of the most important legal instruments because they determine the legal relationship between professional players and clubs while providing the contractual basis for remuneration, sporting obligations, disciplinary responsibility, dispute resolution, and employment protection (Gardiner et al., 2012; FIFA, 2025). The continuing commercialization of football has simultaneously increased contractual complexity because contractual relationships are now influenced not only by private agreements but also by mandatory statutory provisions and sports regulations governing professional football (FIFA, 2025). Consequently, the governance of professional football can no longer be understood solely from a commercial or sporting perspective but must also be examined through the interaction between labour law, contract law, sports law, and institutional regulations. This multidimensional legal environment provides the foundation for examining employment relationships within professional football, particularly in jurisdictions such as Indonesia where the professional football industry continues to experience rapid institutional development.

The commercialization of professional football has fundamentally transformed the legal relationship between players and clubs into an

employment relationship governed by contractual rights and obligations rather than merely sporting commitments (Gardiner et al., 2012). Professional football players perform services under contractual arrangements requiring them to comply with club policies, training schedules, competitive obligations, performance standards, and managerial supervision in exchange for wages and other contractual benefits (Parrish & Miettinen, 2008). These characteristics correspond to the essential elements of an employment relationship recognized under Indonesian labour law, namely the existence of work, wages, and employer authority, as reflected in Article 1 paragraph (15) of Law Number 13 of 2003 concerning Manpower, as subsequently amended through Law Number 6 of 2023 concerning the Stipulation of Government Regulation in Lieu of Law Number 2 of 2022 on Job Creation into Law. Employment relationships involving professional football players are also situated within the broader legal framework established by Law Number 11 of 2022 concerning Sports, while their contractual implementation is simultaneously governed by the regulatory framework of the Football Association of Indonesia (PSSI) and the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players (RSTP), which establish internationally recognized standards concerning contractual stability, player registration, transfers, and dispute resolution (FIFA, 2025). Consequently, professional football players in Indonesia cannot be regarded solely as ordinary employees under national labour legislation because their employment relationships are simultaneously influenced by the principles of *lex sportiva* governing professional football. Employment contracts therefore function not only as private agreements but also as regulatory instruments operating within the interaction between national labour law and international sports regulations (Gardiner et al., 2012). Such contracts generally regulate wages, contractual duration, sporting performance, occupational discipline, player transfers, renewal procedures, dispute settlement mechanisms, and other legal protections necessary to maintain contractual certainty and sporting integrity (FIFA, 2025). Legal scholarship has increasingly recognized that professional athletes should be treated as workers entitled to employment protection whenever the legal characteristics of an employment relationship are fulfilled, while acknowledging that certain contractual aspects remain subject to specialized sports regulations (Parrish & Miettinen, 2008). Accordingly, the legal characterization of professional football contracts requires harmonization between labour law principles and *lex sportiva* to ensure balanced protection for both clubs and players while preserving the distinctive regulatory structure of professional football. This legal characterization provides an essential foundation for evaluating whether the renewal of employment contracts in Indonesian professional football adequately reflects legal certainty, fairness, and balanced protection within contemporary employment relationships.

Although Indonesian professional football has experienced significant institutional and commercial development, the

implementation of employment contract renewal between professional players and clubs continues to present substantial legal challenges that undermine contractual certainty and employment protection (Hatami, 2018). Contract renewal represents a critical stage because it determines whether the employment relationship will continue under revised contractual terms while simultaneously affecting players' career continuity and clubs' sporting strategies. Ideally, renewal agreements should establish balanced contractual provisions concerning remuneration adjustments, employment duration, performance evaluation, disciplinary obligations, renewal procedures, termination conditions, and dispute resolution. In practice, however, contractual disputes continue to arise, particularly regarding salary arrears, unilateral termination, unequal bargaining positions, uncertainty in renewal negotiations, and disagreements concerning revised contractual terms (Safara et al., 2024). These recurring disputes indicate that employment contract renewal has not yet provided comprehensive legal protection for professional football players despite the increasing commercialization of Indonesian football (Safara et al., 2024). Contractual negotiations are frequently dominated by clubs, thereby reducing players' opportunities to negotiate renewal terms on an equal basis and increasing the risk of contractual imbalance. Legal uncertainty is further intensified by the coexistence of Indonesian labour law and the principles of *lex sportiva* because both legal regimes regulate employment relationships through different normative approaches (Ikram et al., 2025). National labour law primarily emphasizes employment protection and statutory rights, whereas sports regulations prioritize contractual stability, sporting integrity, player registration, transfer systems, and specialized dispute resolution mechanisms. This interaction may create practical uncertainty concerning issues such as salary arrears, contract termination, player transfers, and the appropriate jurisdiction for resolving contractual disputes involving professional football players (Ikram et al., 2025). Recent legal studies have similarly identified delayed salary payments as one of the most persistent legal problems affecting Indonesian professional football and demonstrating continuing weaknesses in existing employment protection mechanisms (Yanutama, 2024). These conditions indicate that strengthening employment contract renewal requires not only improved contractual drafting but also greater harmonization between national legislation and internationally recognized sports regulations to ensure legal certainty, balanced protection, and sustainable governance within Indonesian professional football.

Existing studies on professional football employment contracts have primarily examined contractual disputes, labour protection, and the application of sports law within professional football governance (McArdle, 2013). Previous research has also extensively discussed the interaction between labour law and *lex sportiva* in regulating contractual relationships between professional athletes and sports organizations across different jurisdictions (Anderson, 2010). Several recent studies

have further concentrated on legal protection against salary arrears, contractual breaches, and dispute resolution mechanisms affecting professional football players in Indonesia and other countries (Duval, 2019). These studies have undoubtedly contributed to the development of sports law scholarship by strengthening the understanding of contractual governance within professional football. Nevertheless, existing literature remains predominantly focused on the validity, implementation, and termination of employment contracts rather than on the renewal of employment contracts as a distinct legal process requiring independent legal evaluation (Duval, 2019). Contract renewal is not merely an administrative continuation of a previous agreement but represents a new stage of legal negotiation that determines whether the employment relationship will continue under revised contractual conditions. During this stage, both clubs and players face important legal issues concerning salary adjustments, performance evaluation, injury conditions, bargaining power, contract duration, notification periods, and the continuation of employment rights and obligations. Despite its strategic importance, limited scholarly attention has been devoted to examining how these legal issues should be regulated to ensure balanced protection for both parties. Existing studies addressing Indonesian professional football have generally emphasized positive legal frameworks without critically integrating broader philosophical principles capable of evaluating whether contractual renewal genuinely reflects substantive justice rather than merely satisfying procedural legal requirements (Anderson, 2010). Consequently, current scholarship provides only limited guidance regarding how employment contract renewal should reconcile commercial interests, contractual stability, and employment protection within the Indonesian legal system. This limitation becomes increasingly significant because contract renewal directly influences career continuity, institutional sustainability, and legal certainty within professional football organizations. The absence of a comprehensive analysis grounded in the values of Pancasila Justice therefore constitutes an important theoretical and practical gap in contemporary sports law scholarship. Integrating the principles of Pancasila Justice into the legal analysis of employment contract renewal provides a broader normative framework capable of evaluating not only whether contractual renewal complies with statutory and sporting regulations but also whether it upholds human dignity, fairness, social justice, and deliberative decision-making as reflected in the fundamental values of Pancasila. This study therefore seeks to address that gap by examining the renewal of employment contracts between professional football players and professional clubs through the perspective of Pancasila Justice, thereby extending legal analysis beyond conventional labour law and sports law approaches.

The legal complexities surrounding the renewal of employment contracts in professional football demonstrate the necessity of conducting a more comprehensive normative analysis capable of addressing both theoretical and practical deficiencies identified in

previous studies (Foster, 2006). Existing scholarship has provided valuable explanations regarding employment protection, contractual disputes, and sports governance, yet relatively limited attention has been directed toward the legal principles governing employment contract renewal within professional football organizations (Beloff et al., 2012). This study therefore examines the legal framework regulating the renewal of employment contracts between professional football players and professional clubs in Indonesia through the perspective of Pancasila Justice while considering the interaction between national labour law, contract law, sports legislation, PSSI regulations, and the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players. The analysis focuses on evaluating whether current renewal practices adequately reflect legal certainty, fairness, proportionality, and balanced protection for both contracting parties. Particular attention is devoted to identifying legal principles capable of harmonizing Indonesian positive law with the specialized regulatory framework of professional football. Within this framework, the values of Pancasila Justice are operationalized as substantive indicators for evaluating contractual renewal, including respect for human dignity through protection against arbitrary contract termination, the realization of social justice through the fulfillment of remuneration and employment rights, and the principle of deliberation through fair negotiation and dispute resolution procedures. These indicators enable Pancasila Justice to function not merely as a philosophical justification but as a normative analytical framework for assessing the legitimacy and fairness of contractual renewal mechanisms. The study also evaluates whether current renewal practices provide sufficient legal certainty while accommodating the distinctive characteristics of professional football governed by *lex sportiva*. Examining these legal dimensions is expected to clarify the normative position of employment contract renewal within Indonesian sports law while contributing to the harmonization of statutory law and international football regulations (Blackshaw, 2017). Developing such a framework is expected to strengthen contractual certainty, reduce employment disputes, and promote more sustainable governance within Indonesian professional football.

This study offers a distinctive contribution to the development of sports law scholarship by introducing Pancasila Justice as the principal normative framework for evaluating the renewal of employment contracts between professional football players and professional clubs in Indonesia (Sen, 2009). Previous studies have predominantly assessed employment relationships through labour law, contract law, and sports regulations while providing limited discussion concerning the philosophical values that should guide employment contract renewal in achieving substantive justice (Dworkin, 1986). The present research expands existing legal discourse by integrating Indonesian legal philosophy with contemporary principles of employment law and professional football governance within a single analytical framework. Rather than treating Pancasila Justice as a general philosophical concept, this study translates its values into

normative standards for assessing contractual renewal, including the protection of human dignity, equitable bargaining positions, legal certainty, balanced contractual obligations, and fair dispute resolution. This approach enables legal analysis that extends beyond procedural compliance toward evaluating whether employment contract renewal genuinely protects the legitimate interests of both professional clubs and players (Alexy, 2002). The study further contributes by developing a normative model for employment contract renewal that links identified contractual problems with corresponding legal principles and appropriate contractual clauses, thereby providing clearer guidance for future contractual governance. Such a model is expected to support legal reforms aimed at improving contractual certainty while maintaining consistency with Indonesian labour legislation, Law Number 11 of 2022 concerning Sports, PSSI regulations, and internationally recognized principles contained in the FIFA regulatory framework. These legal arguments may assist policymakers, football governing bodies, professional clubs, and legal practitioners in designing employment contract renewal mechanisms that are more transparent, accountable, and equitable (Gardiner & Welch, 2011). Practical contributions are also expected through recommendations intended to reduce contractual disputes, strengthen employment protection, and improve governance within Indonesian professional football organizations. The study additionally enriches comparative sports law literature by demonstrating how an indigenous legal philosophy may function as a substantive normative framework for resolving legal issues arising within a globalized sports industry. Accordingly, the principal novelty of this research lies not only in applying Pancasila Justice to the renewal of employment contracts but also in constructing a comprehensive legal framework capable of harmonizing national legal values with the specialized regulatory system of professional football. This contribution is expected to strengthen both academic understanding and practical implementation of employment contract renewal while promoting a more just, legally certain, and sustainable professional football system in Indonesia.

METHOD

Existing studies on professional football employment contracts have primarily examined contractual disputes, labour protection, and the application of sports law within professional football governance (McArdle, 2013). Previous research has also extensively discussed the interaction between labour law and *lex sportiva* in regulating contractual relationships between professional athletes and sports organizations across different jurisdictions (Anderson, 2010). Several recent studies have further concentrated on legal protection against salary arrears, contractual breaches, and dispute resolution mechanisms affecting professional football players in Indonesia and other countries (Duval,

2019). These studies have undoubtedly contributed to the development of sports law scholarship by strengthening the understanding of contractual governance within professional football. Nevertheless, existing literature remains predominantly focused on the validity, implementation, and termination of employment contracts rather than on the renewal of employment contracts as a distinct legal process requiring independent legal evaluation (Duval, 2019). Contract renewal is not merely an administrative continuation of a previous agreement but represents a new stage of legal negotiation that determines whether the employment relationship will continue under revised contractual conditions. During this stage, both clubs and players face important legal issues concerning salary adjustments, performance evaluation, injury conditions, bargaining power, contract duration, notification periods, and the continuation of employment rights and obligations. Despite its strategic importance, limited scholarly attention has been devoted to examining how these legal issues should be regulated to ensure balanced protection for both parties. Existing studies addressing Indonesian professional football have generally emphasized positive legal frameworks without critically integrating broader philosophical principles capable of evaluating whether contractual renewal genuinely reflects substantive justice rather than merely satisfying procedural legal requirements (Anderson, 2010). Consequently, current scholarship provides only limited guidance regarding how employment contract renewal should reconcile commercial interests, contractual stability, and employment protection within the Indonesian legal system. This limitation becomes increasingly significant because contract renewal directly influences career continuity, institutional sustainability, and legal certainty within professional football organizations. The absence of a comprehensive analysis grounded in the values of Pancasila Justice therefore constitutes an important theoretical and practical gap in contemporary sports law scholarship. Integrating the principles of Pancasila Justice into the legal analysis of employment contract renewal provides a broader normative framework capable of evaluating not only whether contractual renewal complies with statutory and sporting regulations but also whether it upholds human dignity, fairness, social justice, and deliberative decision-making as reflected in the fundamental values of Pancasila. This study therefore seeks to address that gap by examining the renewal of employment contracts between professional football players and professional clubs through the perspective of Pancasila Justice, thereby extending legal analysis beyond conventional labour law and sports law approaches.

The legal complexities surrounding the renewal of employment contracts in professional football demonstrate the necessity of conducting a more comprehensive normative analysis capable of addressing both theoretical and practical deficiencies identified in previous studies (Foster, 2006). Existing scholarship has provided valuable explanations regarding employment protection, contractual

disputes, and sports governance, yet relatively limited attention has been directed toward the legal principles governing employment contract renewal within professional football organizations (Beloff et al., 2012). This study therefore examines the legal framework regulating the renewal of employment contracts between professional football players and professional clubs in Indonesia through the perspective of Pancasila Justice while considering the interaction between national labour law, contract law, sports legislation, PSSI regulations, and the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players. The analysis focuses on evaluating whether current renewal practices adequately reflect legal certainty, fairness, proportionality, and balanced protection for both contracting parties. Particular attention is devoted to identifying legal principles capable of harmonizing Indonesian positive law with the specialized regulatory framework of professional football. Within this framework, the values of Pancasila Justice are operationalized as substantive indicators for evaluating contractual renewal, including respect for human dignity through protection against arbitrary contract termination, the realization of social justice through the fulfillment of remuneration and employment rights, and the principle of deliberation through fair negotiation and dispute resolution procedures. These indicators enable Pancasila Justice to function not merely as a philosophical justification but as a normative analytical framework for assessing the legitimacy and fairness of contractual renewal mechanisms. The study also evaluates whether current renewal practices provide sufficient legal certainty while accommodating the distinctive characteristics of professional football governed by *lex sportiva*. Examining these legal dimensions is expected to clarify the normative position of employment contract renewal within Indonesian sports law while contributing to the harmonization of statutory law and international football regulations (Blackshaw, 2017). Developing such a framework is expected to strengthen contractual certainty, reduce employment disputes, and promote more sustainable governance within Indonesian professional football.

This study offers a distinctive contribution to the development of sports law scholarship by introducing Pancasila Justice as the principal normative framework for evaluating the renewal of employment contracts between professional football players and professional clubs in Indonesia (Sen, 2009). Previous studies have predominantly assessed employment relationships through labour law, contract law, and sports regulations while providing limited discussion concerning the philosophical values that should guide employment contract renewal in achieving substantive justice (Dworkin, 1986). The present research expands existing legal discourse by integrating Indonesian legal philosophy with contemporary principles of employment law and professional football governance within a single analytical framework. Rather than treating Pancasila Justice as a general philosophical concept, this study translates its values into normative standards for assessing contractual renewal, including the protection of human dignity, equitable bargaining positions, legal

certainty, balanced contractual obligations, and fair dispute resolution. This approach enables legal analysis that extends beyond procedural compliance toward evaluating whether employment contract renewal genuinely protects the legitimate interests of both professional clubs and players (Alexy, 2002). The study further contributes by developing a normative model for employment contract renewal that links identified contractual problems with corresponding legal principles and appropriate contractual clauses, thereby providing clearer guidance for future contractual governance. Such a model is expected to support legal reforms aimed at improving contractual certainty while maintaining consistency with Indonesian labour legislation, Law Number 11 of 2022 concerning Sports, PSSI regulations, and internationally recognized principles contained in the FIFA regulatory framework. These legal arguments may assist policymakers, football governing bodies, professional clubs, and legal practitioners in designing employment contract renewal mechanisms that are more transparent, accountable, and equitable (Gardiner & Welch, 2011). Practical contributions are also expected through recommendations intended to reduce contractual disputes, strengthen employment protection, and improve governance within Indonesian professional football organizations. The study additionally enriches comparative sports law literature by demonstrating how an indigenous legal philosophy may function as a substantive normative framework for resolving legal issues arising within a globalized sports industry. Accordingly, the principal novelty of this research lies not only in applying Pancasila Justice to the renewal of employment contracts but also in constructing a comprehensive legal framework capable of harmonizing national legal values with the specialized regulatory system of professional football. This contribution is expected to strengthen both academic understanding and practical implementation of employment contract renewal while promoting a more just, legally certain, and sustainable professional football system in Indonesia.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The Concept of Implementing Employment Contracts Between Professional Football Players and Clubs in Indonesia Based on the Principle of Pancasila Justice.

The present findings demonstrate that the legal relationship between professional football players and professional clubs in Indonesia should not be interpreted solely as a private contractual arrangement but rather as a special employment relationship governed simultaneously by national labour law, contract law, sports law, and the regulatory framework of *lex sportiva*. Under Indonesian law, an employment relationship is characterized by the existence of work, wages, and employer authority, as stipulated in Article 1 paragraph (15) of Law Number 13 of 2003 concerning Manpower, as amended by Law Number 6 of 2023 concerning the Stipulation of Government Regulation in Lieu of Law Number 2 of 2022 on Job Creation into Law. These legal elements

are reflected in the contractual relationship between professional football players and clubs, where players perform sporting services under the direction and supervision of clubs in return for remuneration and other contractual benefits. However, unlike ordinary employment relationships, professional football employment is also governed by Law Number 11 of 2022 concerning Sports, the regulatory framework of the Football Association of Indonesia (PSSI), and the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players (RSTP), which regulate contractual stability, player registration, transfers, and dispute resolution. Consequently, the legal status of professional football players cannot be understood exclusively through the perspective of labour law because their employment relationship simultaneously operates within the specialized regulatory framework of professional football. This finding extends previous discussions by emphasizing that employment contracts in professional football represent a hybrid legal relationship in which statutory employment protection coexists with sports-specific regulatory obligations. A similar conclusion was reached by Louw, who argued that employment contracts in professional sports differ from ordinary civil agreements because athletes remain subject not only to their employers but also to extensive regulatory authority exercised by sports governing bodies, thereby creating an atypical employment relationship requiring stronger legal protection than conventional contractual models (Louw, 2022). The present study nevertheless advances this perspective by demonstrating that the Indonesian legal framework requires an additional normative dimension grounded in Pancasila Justice to ensure that contractual autonomy, organizational authority, and sports regulations remain consistent with the constitutional objective of achieving substantive justice for both clubs and professional football players.

This argument also complements the findings of O'Leary, who observed that governing bodies frequently impose standardized employment regulations that significantly influence the contractual position of professional athletes while providing only limited opportunities for players to participate in the formulation of rules directly affecting their employment interests. Such conditions are likewise evident within Indonesian professional football, where contractual relationships are influenced not only by agreements negotiated between clubs and players but also by mandatory provisions contained in PSSI regulations and FIFA rules governing professional football. The interaction between these regulatory systems illustrates that the employment relationship cannot be governed exclusively by the principle of freedom of contract because contractual autonomy is necessarily limited by statutory labour protections and sports regulations intended to preserve contractual stability and sporting integrity. At the same time, this coexistence of national law and *lex sportiva* may create normative overlap concerning issues such as contract termination, salary arrears, player transfers, and dispute resolution, requiring harmonized legal interpretation rather than the automatic application of one legal regime

over another. Unlike the institutional perspective emphasized by O'Leary, the present research places greater emphasis on balancing regulatory authority with constitutional principles of justice embedded within the Indonesian legal system through the application of Pancasila Justice. The findings also correspond with recent scholarship recognizing elite athletes as workers despite contractual classifications that occasionally limit the application of ordinary employment protections. That scholarship concluded that remuneration, organizational control, and continuous service constitute strong indicators of an employment relationship regardless of contractual terminology. The present study reinforces this position by demonstrating that professional football players in Indonesia satisfy these substantive employment indicators while remaining subject to a specialized regulatory environment governed by national legislation, PSSI regulations, and FIFA rules. Accordingly, the legal nature of employment contracts in Indonesian professional football should be interpreted through an integrated legal framework combining labour law, contract law, sports law, and *lex sportiva* while ensuring that their implementation remains consistent with the values of Pancasila Justice. Within this framework, the Second Principle of Pancasila requires protection of players' human dignity through safeguards against arbitrary contract termination, the Fourth Principle requires renewal negotiations and contractual decision-making to be conducted through fair deliberation, while the Fifth Principle requires balanced contractual rights, timely remuneration, and equitable treatment throughout the employment relationship. Such an integrated interpretation provides stronger legal certainty, harmonizes the relationship between national law and sports regulations, promotes balanced contractual relations, and establishes a more coherent legal foundation for protecting both the commercial sustainability of professional clubs and the employment rights of professional football players.

The present findings further demonstrate that employment contracts constitute the principal legal instrument for establishing legal certainty and balanced protection between professional football players and clubs throughout both the implementation and renewal of the employment relationship. Employment contracts perform not only a contractual function but also a regulatory function by defining reciprocal rights and obligations while providing legal mechanisms for resolving disputes arising during contractual performance, renewal, and termination. In accordance with Article 1320 of the Indonesian Civil Code, every agreement must satisfy the legal requirements of consent, legal capacity, a definite object, and a lawful cause. However, professional football employment contracts must additionally comply with mandatory provisions of Indonesian labour legislation, Law Number 11 of 2022 concerning Sports, PSSI regulations, and the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players, thereby distinguishing them from ordinary civil contracts. This finding supports the argument advanced by Hatami (2018) that professional football employment agreements in Indonesia cannot rely exclusively on the principle of

freedom of contract because they must accommodate the interaction between national labour law and *lex sportiva* to ensure greater legal certainty for both parties. The present study nevertheless extends this perspective by demonstrating that contractual certainty should also reflect the constitutional values of Pancasila Justice so that contractual provisions achieve substantive fairness rather than merely satisfying formal legal requirements. Safara, Ramadhani, Fayura, and Sari (2024) similarly found that delayed salary payments remain one of the most significant legal problems in Indonesian professional football because breaches of wage obligations undermine the protective function of employment contracts despite the existence of written agreements. This observation closely corresponds with the present findings because contractual protection becomes ineffective when clubs fail to fulfil their financial obligations while players continue performing their contractual duties in good faith. Hansson (2024) further explained that recent developments in football labour regulation increasingly emphasize wage protection, contractual transparency, and effective enforcement as essential components of fair employment relationships rather than treating remuneration solely as a commercial matter. The present findings complement this international perspective by demonstrating that balanced contractual protection should encompass legal certainty, equal bargaining opportunities, timely wage fulfilment, transparent renewal procedures, and accessible dispute resolution mechanisms throughout the contractual relationship. These protections become particularly important during the renewal of employment contracts, where disparities in bargaining power frequently influence salary adjustments, contract duration, performance evaluation, injury status, and the continuation of employment. Consequently, employment contracts should function not merely as documentary evidence of agreement but as comprehensive legal instruments capable of safeguarding reciprocal rights and obligations in accordance with Indonesian labour law, sports regulations, and the principles of Pancasila Justice. Such an integrated approach strengthens contractual trust, reduces the likelihood of employment disputes, and supports sustainable governance within Indonesian professional football while ensuring that contractual renewal reflects substantive justice rather than solely procedural compliance.

The present findings demonstrate that the actualization of Pancasila Justice transforms employment contracts in professional football from ordinary legal instruments into normative frameworks that embody the constitutional values underpinning the Indonesian legal system. Accordingly, employment contracts should regulate legal relationships not only through reciprocal rights and obligations but also through substantive principles that uphold human dignity, social justice, legal certainty, and balanced protection between professional football players and clubs. This finding expands the theoretical framework proposed by Wibowo and Subkhan (2022), who argued that Pancasila functions as the philosophical foundation of Indonesian law because

every legal norm should ultimately reflect justice, humanity, and social welfare rather than merely procedural legality. The present study extends this perspective by demonstrating that the implementation and renewal of employment contracts should be interpreted in light of the constitutional values embodied in Pancasila rather than solely through contractual autonomy. The Second Principle of Pancasila, "Just and Civilized Humanity," requires employment contracts to recognize professional football players as legal subjects possessing equal dignity and fundamental employment rights instead of treating them merely as commercial assets within the football industry. This principle is reflected through contractual provisions protecting players against arbitrary termination, guaranteeing fair working conditions, and ensuring that disciplinary measures are imposed in accordance with due process. Furthermore, the Fourth Principle, "Democracy Guided by the Inner Wisdom in the Unanimity Arising out of Deliberations Amongst Representatives," requires that contract renewal negotiations be conducted through fair deliberation, transparent communication, and meaningful participation by both clubs and players rather than through unilateral contractual decisions. Arliman (2018) similarly explained that substantive justice under Pancasila emphasizes proportional equality, equitable legal protection, and the realization of human dignity through the harmonization of individual rights and collective welfare rather than relying exclusively on formal legal equality. The present findings therefore demonstrate that Pancasila Justice is capable of functioning as a concrete analytical framework for evaluating whether employment contracts genuinely achieve substantive justice rather than merely satisfying formal legal requirements.

This perspective corresponds closely with the present findings because contractual justice cannot be achieved solely through compliance with written contractual provisions while structural inequality and unequal bargaining power continue to disadvantage professional football players during both the implementation and renewal of employment contracts. Kusumaatmadja (2023) further emphasized that the Fifth Principle of Pancasila, "Social Justice for All Indonesian People," requires legal institutions to ensure that every legal relationship generates equitable benefits, balanced obligations, and effective legal protection for all parties involved. The present research complements this argument by demonstrating that employment contracts should distribute contractual rights, economic benefits, and legal responsibilities proportionally while preventing discriminatory contractual practices, delayed salary payments, and unfair renewal conditions that undermine substantive fairness within professional football. The realization of social justice also requires clubs to fulfil wage obligations in a timely manner, provide transparent performance evaluations during renewal negotiations, and avoid exploiting disparities in bargaining power when determining contractual terms. These findings correspond with the objectives of Indonesian labour law, which seeks to provide legal protection for workers while maintaining balanced

industrial relations between employers and employees. Consequently, Pancasila Justice strengthens the legitimacy of employment contracts by ensuring that contractual freedom remains subject to constitutional values emphasizing humanity, equality, proportionality, and social responsibility. The analysis therefore confirms that the Second, Fourth, and Fifth Principles of Pancasila collectively establish a more comprehensive model of substantive justice by protecting human dignity, encouraging fair contractual negotiations, promoting equitable distribution of contractual rights and obligations, and strengthening sustainable employment relationships between professional football players and professional clubs in Indonesia.

The present findings further demonstrate that the implementation and renewal of employment contracts in Indonesian professional football require harmonization between civil law, labour law, sports law, and the regulatory framework of international football to establish a coherent legal system capable of ensuring legal certainty and substantive justice. Employment contracts cannot rely exclusively on the provisions of the Indonesian Civil Code because the contractual relationship between professional football players and clubs simultaneously constitutes an employment relationship governed by Law Number 13 of 2003 concerning Manpower as amended by Law Number 6 of 2023, while sporting activities are also regulated by Law Number 11 of 2022 concerning Sports together with the regulatory framework established by PSSI and the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players (RSTP). This finding supports the argument advanced by Hatami (2018), who explained that employment contracts in Indonesian professional football represent legal relationships governed simultaneously by the Indonesian Civil Code, labour legislation, and *lex sportiva*, thereby requiring an integrated legal approach rather than isolated statutory interpretation. The present research extends this perspective by demonstrating that harmonization should also incorporate the philosophical values of Pancasila Justice to prevent normative conflicts between contractual autonomy, employment protection, and sporting governance. Parrish and Miettinen (2008) similarly argued that modern sports governance increasingly depends upon the interaction between national legal systems and transnational sporting regulations because neither legal regime can independently resolve the complex employment issues arising within professional football. This comparative perspective is particularly relevant in Indonesia, where contractual issues relating to salary arrears, contract renewal, unilateral termination, player transfers, and dispute resolution frequently involve the simultaneous application of national legislation and football regulations. Rather than viewing these legal regimes as competing systems, the present findings demonstrate that they should be interpreted harmoniously according to the principle of legal coherence, whereby labour legislation provides minimum employment protection while *lex sportiva* regulates the technical and institutional aspects specific to professional football. Weatherill (2017) further emphasized that sports law has evolved into a hybrid legal system

combining public regulation, private contractual autonomy, and institutional governance through international sporting organizations. The present findings complement this argument by demonstrating that legal harmonization becomes more effective when national legislation and international football regulations operate within a unified normative framework guided by the principles of humanity, equality, legal certainty, deliberation, and social justice embodied in Pancasila. Such harmonization strengthens legal protection for professional football players while simultaneously providing greater legal certainty for clubs, football governing bodies, and dispute resolution institutions. Accordingly, the development of an employment contract renewal model based on Pancasila Justice represents not merely a philosophical recommendation but a normative necessity capable of integrating the Indonesian Civil Code, labour legislation, Law Number 11 of 2022 concerning Sports, PSSI regulations, and the FIFA regulatory framework into a coherent legal system that supports substantive justice, contractual stability, and sustainable governance within Indonesian professional football.

Conceptual Renewal of Employment Contracts Between Professional Football Clubs and Players to Protect the Interests of the Parties and Promote the Development of Indonesian Professional Football

The present findings demonstrate that the existing employment contract model between professional football players and clubs in Indonesia has not yet provided optimal legal protection because contractual implementation continues to generate legal uncertainty and recurring disputes between the parties. Although employment contracts establish the formal basis of the relationship between clubs and players, their implementation cannot be understood solely as a matter of private contractual autonomy because professional football employment relationships are also subject to mandatory labour protections, sports regulations, and the principles of *lex sportiva*. Under Indonesian legal principles, contractual agreements must comply with the requirements of a valid agreement as regulated under Article 1320 of the Indonesian Civil Code, while employment relationships must also fulfil the elements of work, wages, and employer authority as recognized under Article 1 paragraph (15) of Law Number 13 of 2003 concerning Manpower, as amended by Law Number 6 of 2023. The present finding supports the argument advanced by Hatami (2018), who explained that employment relationships in Indonesian professional football operate within the interaction of civil law, labour law, and *lex sportiva*, yet their practical implementation continues to encounter weaknesses in ensuring equal legal protection for both clubs and players. The present research extends this perspective by demonstrating that contractual deficiencies originate not only from legal pluralism but also from the absence of specific contractual mechanisms capable of maintaining substantive fairness,

particularly during the renewal process where differences in bargaining power may influence salary negotiations, contract duration, performance evaluation, and continuation of employment rights. Blackshaw (2009) similarly argued that effective governance in professional sport depends upon contractual arrangements that provide transparency, accountability, and enforceable legal rights because contractual ambiguity inevitably increases the likelihood of employment disputes. This observation corresponds with the Indonesian professional football system, where disagreements concerning contractual interpretation, delayed salary payments, unilateral termination, and contractual obligations continue to create disputes requiring resolution through specialized mechanisms such as the PSSI National Dispute Resolution Chamber (NDRC) and, in certain circumstances, FIFA dispute resolution mechanisms.

Weatherill (2017) further emphasized that modern sports law requires contractual relationships to integrate legal certainty with institutional governance because sporting organizations exercise significant regulatory authority over employment relationships within professional competitions. The present findings complement this argument by demonstrating that employment contracts in Indonesian professional football require a renewal framework that balances regulatory compliance, contractual autonomy, and substantive justice. Such renewal should not merely extend the duration of an existing agreement but should function as a legal mechanism for reassessing contractual fairness, clarifying reciprocal obligations, and preventing potential disputes before they occur. A renewed contract should therefore contain transparent provisions concerning remuneration, performance obligations, injury-related conditions, contract duration, termination procedures, dispute resolution mechanisms, and the rights of both parties during the renewal period. This approach reduces the structural imbalance that frequently places players in weaker bargaining positions while simultaneously preserving the legitimate interests of professional clubs as employers responsible for sporting and financial sustainability. Viewed from the perspective of Pancasila Justice, contractual renewal must also reflect the values of human dignity, deliberation, and social justice by ensuring that players participate meaningfully in negotiations and that contractual outcomes provide balanced protection rather than merely reflecting the stronger bargaining position of clubs. The analysis therefore confirms that the existing employment contract model requires substantial legal reform through a more comprehensive renewal mechanism capable of strengthening legal protection, improving contractual certainty, minimizing employment disputes, and establishing a more equitable professional football system in Indonesia.

The present findings further demonstrate that the standard employment contract used in Indonesian professional football requires substantive renewal to achieve greater legal certainty and contractual fairness for both clubs and professional players. Standardized contractual provisions undoubtedly contribute to administrative

uniformity and regulatory compliance; however, they cannot fully address the diverse legal, economic, and sporting circumstances that arise throughout professional football employment relationships. This finding supports the argument advanced by McArdle (2013), who explained that contractual regulation in professional sport should remain sufficiently flexible to accommodate evolving employment practices while preserving legal certainty and institutional integrity. The present research extends this perspective by demonstrating that contractual renewal should not merely revise technical provisions but should also strengthen substantive legal protection through clauses that address specific legal risks emerging during the continuation of employment relationships. These risks include unequal bargaining positions during renewal negotiations, uncertainty regarding salary adjustments, performance-based evaluation, injury conditions, contract extension periods, and notification requirements before contract expiration. Gardiner et al. (2012) similarly argued that modern sports contracts should evolve alongside the commercialization of professional sport because increasingly complex employment relationships require contractual provisions capable of preventing disputes before they arise. This observation corresponds with the Indonesian professional football system where the Professional Standard Contract issued by PSSI provides a common contractual framework but still requires continuous improvement to address practical challenges arising from contract implementation and renewal.

Substantive renewal through carefully drafted amendments and contractual addenda is therefore essential to clarify rights, obligations, performance standards, dispute resolution procedures, and mechanisms for contractual modification while remaining consistent with the regulatory framework established by PSSI and FIFA. From the perspective of contract law, such renewal does not eliminate the principle of freedom of contract but ensures that contractual autonomy operates within the boundaries of good faith, proportionality, and mandatory legal protection. This approach is consistent with Article 1338 of the Indonesian Civil Code, which recognizes that agreements legally made bind the parties as law while requiring their implementation in good faith. Accordingly, employment contract renewal should be designed not only to protect club interests in maintaining sporting performance and financial stability but also to guarantee players' employment rights, remuneration certainty, and fair participation in contractual decision-making. The integration of these principles reflects the application of Pancasila Justice, particularly the values of humanity and social justice, by ensuring that contractual relationships generate balanced benefits and responsibilities for both parties. The analysis therefore confirms that substantive renewal of the standard employment contract represents an essential legal reform because it enhances contractual quality, reduces potential disputes, strengthens legal certainty, and promotes a more balanced and sustainable employment relationship within Indonesian professional football.

The present findings demonstrate that strengthening employment contracts through improved formalization mechanisms requires careful consideration of the legal characteristics of professional football employment relationships in Indonesia. Although transforming employment contracts from privately executed agreements into authentic notarial deeds may provide stronger evidentiary value and improve contractual certainty, notarization should not be interpreted as an automatic solution to all contractual disputes or as a substitute for substantive fairness between clubs and players. Under Indonesian contract law, an authentic deed as regulated under Article 1868 of the Indonesian Civil Code possesses stronger evidentiary status because it is made in the form prescribed by law before an authorized public official. However, the function of an authentic deed primarily concerns the strength of proof regarding the existence and content of the agreement rather than guaranteeing that all contractual provisions are substantively fair or free from potential disputes. Therefore, the use of notarial deeds in professional football employment contracts should be understood as a preventive legal mechanism that strengthens contractual transparency, legal accountability, and evidentiary certainty rather than as a mandatory requirement replacing existing contractual systems established within professional football governance. This finding supports the argument advanced by Salim H.S. (2021), who explained that authentic deeds provide stronger legal certainty than private agreements because they possess perfect evidentiary force unless successfully challenged through legally recognized procedures. The present research extends this perspective by demonstrating that notarial involvement may contribute to improving the quality of contractual drafting by ensuring that parties receive appropriate legal explanations regarding contractual rights, obligations, and consequences before entering into or renewing employment agreements. Habib Adjie (2018) similarly argued that notarial authentication functions as a preventive legal mechanism because it ensures compliance with statutory requirements while protecting the interests of contracting parties through greater procedural certainty. This perspective corresponds with the employment relationship in Indonesian professional football, where contractual disputes frequently emerge from unclear clauses, unequal bargaining positions, salary obligations, termination conditions, and differing interpretations regarding the rights and responsibilities of clubs and players.

The use of authentic notarial deeds in professional football employment contracts should therefore be positioned as an optional strengthening mechanism rather than an absolute legal obligation, considering the practical characteristics of football governance, contractual efficiency, and the existing standard contract system established by PSSI. Mandatory notarization may create additional administrative and financial burdens, particularly for professional clubs and players operating under different economic capacities, while the primary objective of contract renewal should remain the achievement of

balanced and fair contractual arrangements. Nevertheless, when applied appropriately, notarial involvement may provide additional institutional safeguards by encouraging comprehensive legal review before contractual obligations become binding upon the parties. Such a mechanism is particularly relevant during contract renewal because renewal negotiations often involve substantial modifications concerning remuneration, performance obligations, contract duration, transfer conditions, and termination provisions. Through greater legal supervision, parties may ensure that renewed contracts comply with Indonesian contract law, labour law principles, sports regulations, and the values of Pancasila Justice. Stronger evidentiary value simultaneously benefits professional clubs by protecting legitimate commercial interests while ensuring that professional players obtain clearer contractual protection against arbitrary contractual practices and violations of agreed obligations. The analysis therefore confirms that authentic notarial employment contracts may serve as an important supporting reform mechanism within Indonesian professional football, provided that their implementation remains proportionate, practical, and integrated with existing football regulatory frameworks. Rather than replacing substantive legal protection, notarization should function as an instrument that strengthens legal certainty, improves contractual quality, and supports more balanced employment relationships between professional football players and clubs.

The present findings further demonstrate that the inclusion of additional contractual clauses based on Pancasila Justice enhances the effectiveness of employment contracts by strengthening legal protection, preventing contractual disputes, and promoting balanced employment relationships between professional football clubs and players in Indonesia. Standard contractual provisions alone cannot adequately anticipate the increasingly complex legal, economic, and professional issues that arise throughout modern football employment relationships, particularly during the renewal stage where parties must renegotiate existing obligations and future expectations. This finding supports the argument advanced by Foster (2006), who explained that contractual governance in professional sport should continuously evolve to accommodate changing commercial and regulatory environments while maintaining fairness and legal certainty for all stakeholders. The present research extends this perspective by demonstrating that employment contract renewal should incorporate specific clauses addressing identifiable legal risks, including transparent salary adjustment mechanisms, performance evaluation procedures, injury-related protections, contract extension conditions, player transfer arrangements, legal assistance provisions, and effective dispute resolution mechanisms. These clauses are necessary because renewal negotiations frequently occur within unequal bargaining conditions, where clubs may possess stronger institutional and financial positions compared with individual players.

Anderson (2010) similarly argued that contractual certainty in professional sport depends not only upon compliance with sporting regulations but also upon the existence of transparent contractual mechanisms capable of balancing commercial interests with the legal rights of athletes. The present findings complement this perspective by demonstrating that additional contractual clauses should be directly connected with the principles of Pancasila Justice. The principle of humanity requires contractual provisions that protect players' dignity and employment security, the principle of deliberation requires fair negotiation procedures during contract renewal, and the principle of social justice requires proportional distribution of rights, obligations, and economic benefits between clubs and players. Accordingly, contractual innovation should not merely focus on increasing regulatory detail but should establish a fairer legal structure capable of preventing disputes before they occur. The analysis therefore confirms that a Pancasila Justice-based contractual model requires employment contracts to evolve from standardized administrative documents into comprehensive legal instruments that provide transparency, accountability, and balanced protection throughout the professional football employment relationship.

This perspective corresponds with the Indonesian professional football system, where additional contractual clauses concerning legal representation, transfer mechanisms, and dispute resolution may strengthen the understanding and protection of contractual rights and obligations between clubs and professional players. A legal representation clause ensures that both parties, particularly players who may possess a weaker bargaining position, have the opportunity to understand the legal consequences of contractual provisions before entering into legally binding agreements. Such protection is consistent with the principle of good faith as recognized under Article 1338 paragraph (3) of the Indonesian Civil Code, which requires agreements to be implemented fairly and responsibly by the contracting parties. Clauses regulating predetermined transfer mechanisms may also provide greater commercial certainty by establishing transparent procedures regarding player mobility, compensation, and the economic interests of clubs, while simultaneously preventing uncertainty regarding future career opportunities for players. However, such clauses must remain consistent with the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players (RSTP), particularly the principles governing contractual stability, transfer agreements, and the protection of contractual parties within professional football. Furthermore, clear dispute resolution clauses referring disputes to the appropriate institutional mechanisms, including the National Dispute Resolution Chamber (NDRC), the FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber (DRC), or the Court of Arbitration for Sport (CAS) where applicable, establish predictable procedures that reduce jurisdictional uncertainty and improve the effectiveness of dispute settlement. The integration of these contractual provisions reflects the principles of Pancasila Justice because contractual relationships should

promote equality, legal certainty, proportional protection, and mutual benefit rather than merely protecting the interests of the party with stronger economic or institutional capacity. The analysis therefore confirms that the incorporation of additional contractual clauses based on Pancasila Justice represents an important legal innovation because it transforms employment contracts from merely administrative agreements into comprehensive legal instruments capable of preventing disputes, strengthening contractual governance, and supporting sustainable professional football development in Indonesia.

Accordingly, this study proposes a comprehensive renewal framework for contractual clauses governing employment relationships between professional football clubs and players in Indonesia. The proposed reform aims to strengthen legal certainty, balance the rights and obligations of contracting parties, and establish a contractual framework that reflects the principles of Pancasila Justice while supporting the sustainable development of Indonesian professional football. The existing Professional Standard Contract issued by PSSI provides an important regulatory foundation for professional football employment relationships. Nevertheless, the findings of this study indicate that several contractual aspects require further strengthening to address increasingly complex legal, commercial, and institutional challenges, particularly those arising during the renewal and continuation of employment relationships. Therefore, future employment contracts should incorporate additional clauses designed to improve transparency, contractual balance, and legal protection for both parties.

First, employment contracts may include provisions requiring stronger formal documentation mechanisms, including the possibility of execution before a notary public when considered necessary by the parties. Such formalization does not replace the substantive requirements of employment protection or automatically eliminate contractual disputes; however, it strengthens evidentiary certainty regarding the existence, content, and consent of the parties as recognized under Article 1868 of the Indonesian Civil Code. The use of authentic deeds should therefore function as a preventive legal instrument that improves contractual accountability, clarifies contractual obligations, and reduces disputes concerning interpretation or validity of agreements. This mechanism must nevertheless remain practical and compatible with the contractual system established within professional football governance.

Second, employment contracts should include a mandatory legal representation clause allowing both parties, particularly professional players, to obtain independent legal assistance from advocates or qualified legal consultants before signing or renewing agreements. Considering that professional players may experience unequal bargaining positions compared with clubs possessing greater institutional and financial resources, this provision promotes informed consent, contractual transparency, and procedural fairness. Independent legal assistance enables each party to understand the legal

implications of contractual provisions, including remuneration arrangements, termination conditions, transfer obligations, and renewal terms. Such a clause also supports the implementation of Pancasila Justice by ensuring that contractual negotiations are conducted through fair deliberation rather than solely through economic advantage or institutional dominance.

Third, employment contracts should incorporate provisions regulating player transfer mechanisms and economic arrangements related to player mobility. Rather than establishing predetermined transfer values without considering the applicable football regulatory framework, the contract should provide transparent procedures concerning transfer negotiations, compensation mechanisms, and the rights of players and clubs during potential transfers. Such provisions provide commercial certainty for clubs that invest in player development while simultaneously protecting players from uncertainty regarding their professional career opportunities. The clause should remain consistent with FIFA RSTP principles concerning contractual stability and transfer regulation to ensure compatibility between national contractual practices and international football governance.

Fourth, employment contracts should contain comprehensive governing law and dispute resolution clauses establishing a clear and legally appropriate mechanism for resolving contractual disputes. The dispute resolution process should prioritize negotiation and mediation as initial mechanisms to encourage amicable settlement and preserve professional relationships between clubs and players. Where disputes cannot be resolved through these mechanisms, the parties should utilize the appropriate dispute resolution institutions based on the nature and dimension of the dispute. Domestic employment disputes involving Indonesian clubs and players may be submitted to the PSSI National Dispute Resolution Chamber (NDRC), while disputes involving an international dimension should be assessed according to FIFA regulations and the jurisdictional requirements of the FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber (DRC). Submission to the Court of Arbitration for Sport (CAS) should only occur where jurisdiction is available under applicable regulations or arbitration agreements, rather than being considered an automatic final mechanism for every unresolved dispute. This hierarchical approach strengthens procedural efficiency, prevents jurisdictional conflicts, and ensures consistency between Indonesian legal principles and the international framework of *lex sportiva*.

The incorporation of these additional contractual clauses represents a substantive legal reform rather than merely a technical revision of employment agreements. Collectively, these provisions establish a more balanced contractual framework by improving transparency, strengthening preventive legal protection, clarifying dispute resolution mechanisms, and ensuring that contractual renewal reflects the values of legal certainty, fairness, proportionality, and Pancasila Justice. Through this approach, employment contracts in Indonesian professional football may function not only as instruments

governing sporting employment but also as legal mechanisms that support sustainable governance, protect the legitimate interests of clubs and players, and contribute to the long-term development of the professional football industry in Indonesia.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the renewal and implementation of employment contracts between professional football clubs and players in Indonesia require comprehensive legal reform to establish a more equitable, sustainable, and legally certain contractual framework. The existing contractual model has not yet provided optimal protection for both parties because contractual practices continue to generate legal uncertainty, unequal bargaining conditions, and recurring disputes concerning remuneration, contractual obligations, termination, and dispute resolution. Employment contracts in professional football should therefore not be understood merely as administrative documents or private agreements but as comprehensive legal instruments that regulate reciprocal rights and obligations while ensuring employment protection, contractual stability, and professional accountability throughout the employment relationship. The principles of Pancasila provide an appropriate normative foundation for achieving these objectives because they integrate human dignity, equality, deliberation, justice, and social responsibility into contractual governance. The actualization of Pancasila Justice should be reflected from the drafting stage, continue throughout contractual negotiations, and remain applicable during contract implementation, renewal, and enforcement. Through this approach, contractual justice may be achieved not only through formal compliance with contractual provisions but also through substantive fairness that ensures balanced protection between professional football players and clubs. The legal relationship between professional football players and clubs possesses characteristics of both contractual and employment relationships because it simultaneously fulfils the requirements of private agreements under the Indonesian Civil Code and employment relationships recognized under Indonesian labour law. The elements of work, remuneration, and employer authority demonstrate that professional football players perform services within an employment relationship as regulated under Article 1 paragraph (15) of Law Number 13 of 2003 concerning Manpower as amended by Law Number 6 of 2023. Nevertheless, professional football employment also contains specific characteristics arising from the application of sports regulations and *lex sportiva*, including FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players (RSTP) and PSSI regulations. Therefore, legal protection for professional football players should integrate labour protection principles with the regulatory requirements of professional football governance while maintaining the legitimate commercial interests of clubs. Such harmonization ensures that professional players receive appropriate employment protection while acknowledging the unique characteristics of the professional football industry. This study further

concludes that the existing standard employment contract requires substantive renewal to address the increasing legal, commercial, and institutional complexity of contemporary professional football. Contractual reform should strengthen legal certainty by establishing clearer provisions regarding remuneration, contract duration, performance evaluation, renewal procedures, termination conditions, transfer mechanisms, and dispute resolution responsibilities. The proposed transformation of employment contracts into authentic notarial deeds may serve as an important supporting mechanism because authentic instruments provide stronger evidentiary value and improve certainty regarding the existence and content of contractual agreements. However, notarization should not be interpreted as an automatic guarantee of substantive fairness or as a replacement for employment protection; rather, it should function as a preventive legal instrument that strengthens contractual transparency, accountability, and legal certainty. Similarly, the inclusion of independent legal assistance through advocates or qualified legal consultants should become an important component of the contractual process because informed legal advice enables both clubs and players to understand the legal consequences of contractual provisions before providing consent. Such assistance strengthens procedural fairness, reduces inequality in bargaining positions, and minimizes disputes arising from unclear contractual arrangements.

Furthermore, this study concludes that employment contracts should incorporate additional clauses capable of addressing specific legal risks within professional football employment relationships. A transparent transfer mechanism clause may protect the legitimate economic interests of clubs while providing greater certainty for players regarding career mobility and contractual expectations. Contractual provisions concerning dispute resolution should also establish a clear procedural hierarchy by prioritizing negotiation and mediation before referring disputes to the appropriate dispute resolution institutions, including the PSSI National Dispute Resolution Chamber (NDRC), the FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber (DRC), or the Court of Arbitration for Sport (CAS) where jurisdiction exists under applicable regulations. Such mechanisms prevent uncertainty regarding dispute settlement authority and ensure consistency between Indonesian legal principles and international football governance. The harmonization of Indonesian contract law, labour law, sports law, PSSI regulations, and FIFA regulatory frameworks therefore represents an essential component in developing a coherent legal system for professional football employment relationships. Collectively, these reforms establish a contractual model that balances legal certainty, contractual fairness, commercial sustainability, and institutional accountability while remaining consistent with the constitutional values embodied in Pancasila. The proposed employment contract renewal model based on Pancasila Justice demonstrates that contractual governance in professional football should not only focus on regulating economic transactions but

also ensure respect for human dignity, equality of bargaining power, and equitable distribution of rights and obligations between clubs and players. Ultimately, this study proposes a renewed legal framework for employment contract renewal in Indonesian professional football that integrates national legal principles and international sports governance standards to protect the interests of professional football clubs and players while supporting the long-term development, credibility, and sustainable governance of Indonesian professional football.

REFERENCES

- Adjie, H. (2018). *Hukum Notaris Indonesia: Tafsir Tematik terhadap Undang-Undang Jabatan Notaris*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Alexy, R. (2002). *A Theory of Constitutional Rights*. Oxford University Press.
- Anderson, J. (2010). *Modern Sports Law: A Textbook*. Oxford: Hart Publishing.
- Beloff, M., Kerr, T., Demetriou, M., & Beloff, R. (2012). *Sports Law*. Hart Publishing.
- Blackshaw, I. (2009). *Sport Mediation*. The Hague: T.M.C. Asser Press.
- Blackshaw, I. (2017). *International Sports Law: An Introductory Guide*. T.M.C. Asser Press.
- Dietl, H. M., & Weingaertner, C. (2011). The effect of professional football clubs' legal structure on sponsoring revenue. *Available at SSRN 2493130*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2493130>
- Duval, A. (2016). The FIFA regulations on the status and transfer of players: transnational law-making in the shadow of Bosman. In *The Legacy of Bosman: Revisiting the Relationship between EU Law and Sport* (pp. 81-116). The Hague: TMC Asser Press. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-331-3>
- Dworkin, R. (1986). *Law's Empire*. Harvard University Press.
- Fédération Internationale de Football Association. (2025). *FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players*. <https://inside.fifa.com/legal/regulations>
- Foster, K. (2006). Is There a Global Sports Law? *Entertainment and Sports Law Journal*, 2(1).
- Franck, E. (2010). Private firm, public corporation or member's association Governance structures in European football. *International Journal of Sport Finance*, 5(2), 108-127. <https://doi.org/10.1177/155862351000500204>
- Gardiner, S., & Welch, R. (2011). *Sports Governance and the Law*. Routledge.
- Gardiner, S., O'Leary, J., Welch, R., Boyes, S., Naidoo, U., & James, A. (2012). *Sports Law*. Routledge.
- Geeraert, A. (2015). *Sports Governance Observer 2015: The Legitimacy Crisis in International Sports Governance*. Play the Game/Danish Institute for Sports Studies.
- Giulianotti, R., & Robertson, R. (2004). The globalization of football: A study in the glocalization of the "serious life". *The British Journal*

- of *Sociology*, 55(4), 545–568. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-4446.2004.00037.x>
- Hansson, M. (2024). Changing the Game on Wage Setting: Recent EU Activities on Pay and the Divided Football Labour Market. *International Sports Law Journal*, 24, 259–268. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40318-024-00284-7>
- Hatami, R. F. (2018). Perjanjian Kerja Antara Pemain Sepak Bola dan Klub Sepak Bola Indonesia Dengan Lex Sportiva dan Undang-Undang Ketenagakerjaan. *Jurnal Wawasan Yuridika*, 3(1), 95–112. <https://doi.org/10.25072/jwy.v3i1.218>
- Ikram, D., Puspytasari, H. H., & Sari, M. Y. A. R. (2025). Normative Conflicts in Professional Soccer Industrial Relations: The Boundaries Between the Application of Labor Laws and Lex Sportiva. *Lex Journal: Kajian Hukum dan Keadilan*, 9, 683–693. <https://doi.org/10.25139/lex.v9i4.11077>
- International Labour Organization. (2006). *The Employment Relationship: Report V(1), International Labour Conference, 95th Session*. <https://www.ilo.org/publications/employment-relationship-international-labour-conference-95th-session-2006>
- Louw, A. M. (2022). Employment Based on a Fiction: Evaluating the Legitimacy of Traditional Notions of Contract in Their Application to an Atypical Employment Relationship. *Obiter*, 28(2). <https://doi.org/10.17159/obiter.v28i2.14136>
- McArdle, D. (2013). *From Boot Money to Bosman: Football Society and the Law*. Routledge.
- Mitra, B. (2018). *Good Governance in Sport: Theory and Practice*. Routledge.
- O'Leary, L. (2012). Regulating the Employment Relationship in Professional Team Sports. *Industrial Law Journal*, 41(2), 1–27. <https://doi.org/10.1093/indlaw/dws017>
- Parrish, R. (2011). *Sports Law and Policy in the European Union*. Manchester University Press.
- Parrish, R., & García, B. (2025). Elite Athletes and Worker Status. *Industrial Law Journal*, 54(2), 248–277. <https://doi.org/10.1093/indlaw/dwae025>
- Parrish, R., & Miettinen, S. (2008). *The Sporting Exception in European Union Law*. T.M.C. Asser Press. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-90-6704-909-2>
- Safara, R., Ramadhani, N. A., Fayura, A. P., & Sari, A. (2024). Legal Protection of Employment Contract Agreements Between Club and Football Players in Cases of Breach of Wage Payment. *Indonesian Journal of Sports Law*, 1(1), 10–17.
- Salim H.S. (2021). *Hukum Kontrak: Teori dan Teknik Penyusunan Kontrak*. Jakarta: Sinar Grafika.
- Sen, A. (2009). *The Idea of Justice*. Harvard University Press.
- Smith, A. C. T., & Stewart, B. (2015). *Introduction to Sport Marketing*. Routledge.

- Weatherill, S. (2014). *Principles and Practice in EU Sports Law*. Oxford University Press.
- Weatherill, S. (2017). *Principles and Practice in EU Sports Law*. Oxford University Press.
- Yanutama, A. (2024). Perlindungan Hukum Terhadap Tunggakan Gaji Pemain Sepak Bola Profesional Dalam Kontrak Kerja Dengan Klub Sepak Bola Berdasarkan Asas Lex Sportiva. *Law Research Review Quarterly*, 10(3). <https://doi.org/10.15294/llrq.v10i3.3464>